

10.1 INTRODUCTION

The technical analyses presented in the previous chapters discuss the potential for significant adverse environmental impacts to result from the Proposed Action. Such potential impacts were identified in the areas of historic resources, aesthetic resources, and community character as a result of the loss of the St. Paul's School Main Building. Measures have been examined to minimize these anticipated impacts. There is no mitigation that would allow implementation of the Proposed Action and fully mitigate the significant adverse impacts. Measures that would provide partial mitigation are discussed below.

10.2 POTENTIAL MITIGATION MEASURES

10.2.1 HISTORIC AMERICAN BUILDINGS SURVEY (HABS) RECORDATION

HABS recordation would produce a permanent documentary record for the Main Building of St. Paul's School. This proposed work follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Architectural Documentation. The HABS documentation package typically consists of written historical and descriptive data, drawings, and black and white photographs, resulting in a detailed record which conveys a structure's significant features.

HABS Level II documentation would be appropriate, as it is intended for local and state archives. HABS Level II documentation includes the following specifications:

1. Drawings: selected existing drawings, where available, should be photographed with large-format negatives or reproduced on Mylar.
2. Photographs: black and white photographs with large-format negatives of exterior and interior views, or historic views, where available.
3. Written data: history and description.

It is possible that as-built measured drawings (architectural plans) exist for the Main Building, in which case the drawings would be copied on to archivally stable material (e.g., Mylar sheets). However, if architectural drawings do not exist or cannot be found, then measured drawings of the building's most significant elevations (e.g., the south facade [main entrance], the clock tower, and a representative example of one of the wings) along with all floor plans would be prepared, which would be above and beyond the requirements of HABS Level II standards. New large-format (e.g., 4 x 6 or 5 x 7 inches) black and white photographs would include each of the facades, as well as any close-up views to show architectural detail. Existing historic photographs of the Main Building should be duplicated and included in the documentation package. Similarly, historic photographs showing building interiors, functions, and decorative details, should they exist, may be used instead of (or in addition to), modern, large-format interior photographs. A record of interior features (especially the Chapel and other special-function

St. Paul's School Demolition for Additional Open Space

rooms) would be made using the large-format photography. Color digital photography may be used to supplement the record. Copies of the completed documentation package could be submitted to local and state agencies (e.g., the Society for the Preservation of Long Island Antiquities (SPLIA), the Garden City Library, and the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation [OPRHP]) for curation and public access. Note that Ellis Hall may be excluded from the HABS documentation, because it does not contribute to the architectural or historic importance of the Main Building.

10.2.2 SALVAGE AND REUSE/DISPLAY OF ARCHITECTURAL ELEMENTS

Salvage of significant architectural elements, for preservation and display on- or off-site, or for sale for use in another structure, is a potential mitigation measure. Salvage could include both exterior and interior features. These could include:

10.2.2.1 EXTERIOR ELEMENTS

- Bricks with carved students names as a school tradition, principally located on the exterior building at the southwest corner.
- Stained glass windows. The most significant is the Tiffany window located on the west façade of the chapel.
- Stone plaques above the main entrance on Stewart Avenue that read “In Memoriam,” “Alex Turney Stewart,” and “St. Paul’s.” In addition, there is another stone plaque on the central gable above the entrance on the south façade that reads “Ars Et Philosophia.”
- Quatrefoil cast iron railing at the balcony above the main entrance portico.
- Carved stone blocks, depicting profiles of famous philosophers, located on the south wall of the main Stewart Avenue entrance portico.
- Stone finials located on the roof of the Stewart Avenue entrance portico and at the roofline, including the stone crosses.
- Copper finial of the clock tower.
- Cornerstone, located at the northeast corner of the building at the base of the clock tower.

10.2.2.2 INTERIOR ELEMENTS

- Marble and carved wood mantelpieces.
- Elements of the main bronze iron staircase, including newel posts.
- Historic plaques. A stone dedication plaque is located near the main entrance. There is also a bronze Spanish-American war plaque, commemorating the deaths of students who served in that war.
- Dining room murals. These date to the 1960s, and depict the history of St. Paul’s.
- Pews and altar furniture from the chapel.
- Wood paneling.
- Mosaic and tiled flooring.
- Chandeliers/lighting fixtures.

It is expected that a number of the exterior elements described above could be incorporated into the open space as seating or decorative features. Exterior and interior features could also be

stored for potential future display on site or in other Garden City public buildings, or could be sold for reuse in another structure. The salvage and reuse of any features would be contingent up the feasibility of their removal and potential for reuse or sale.

10.2.3 RETENTION AND REUSE OF A PORTION OF THE BUILDING ON SITE

Retaining and reusing a portion of the Main Building on the site is a potential mitigation measure. While there are a number of options that could be considered, the retention of most any portion of the building would interfere with the project's goals and objectives to provide open space for use by the community. However, a number of possible scenarios have been evaluated based on their potential to retain significant architectural components of the building. These include retention of the chapel, all or a portion of the Main Building's Stewart Avenue façade, the clock tower, and the porte-cochere. The feasibility of each of these options is described below.

10.2.3.1 RETENTION OF THE CHAPEL

Retention of the chapel, while preserving a significant component of the Main Building is not programmatically feasible. The chapel is located in the central wing of the Main Building, projecting from the rear of the building. Salvaging the chapel would pose a number of significant issues. Firstly, removal of the remainder of the building would leave the chapel without a façade, which would pose considerable preservation and design challenges, i.e. retaining the chapel separate from the remainder of the building would pose aesthetic concerns as to how to rebuild the south wall. In any reconstruction circumstances there would be loss of architectural and historic integrity. Thus, retention would be of a limited mitigation value.

In addition, the chapel would be located in the center of the proposed open space, which would constrain its use and diminish its benefits for recreational use by the community. As such, retention of the chapel would not be consistent with the goals and objectives of the Proposed Action.

10.2.3.2 RETENTION OF THE STEWART AVENUE FACADE

Retention of all or portions of the Stewart Avenue façade would not be programmatically or economically feasible. As one principal goal of the Proposed Action is to create an open space, retaining any portions of the facades poses design, aesthetic, and safety concerns as to how to buttress a freestanding wall. Retaining an exterior wall would also mean that the interior face of the wall would face the open space, and would require some form of aesthetic treatment. It is expected that salvaging all or a portion of the wall while the remainder of the building is demolished would pose considerable engineering and safety risks. The cost of retaining a portion of the wall during demolition, including bracing and protecting it, would be considerable.

10.2.3.3 RETENTION OF THE CLOCK TOWER

The clock tower is located at the northeast corner of the building and is the tallest portion of the Main Building. The clock tower is connected to the north wing of the building on its south and west façades. While the clock tower is a significant and highly visible component of the Main Building, it would not be feasible to retain this feature of the building as a free standing element. The clock tower is in very poor condition and is structurally connected to the remainder of the north wing of the building. It was not designed to function as a self-supporting element. As described in Chapter 4, "Historic and Archaeological Resources," the clock tower also has

St. Paul's School Demolition for Additional Open Space

structural issues, including cracking and dry rot in some of the wood joist and roof framing members due to water infiltration. Therefore, removing the remainder of the building but retaining the clock tower would pose significant issues of structural stability and safety. In addition, retaining the clock tower separate from the remainder of the building would pose aesthetic concerns as to how to rebuild the south wall and west facades and construct a foundation structure for these walls where none currently exists. The clock tower would be located towards the center of the additional open space, impacting its use and potentially programming. Therefore, this option would not be feasible and would not meet the goals and objectives of the Proposed Action.

10.2.3.4 RETENTION OF THE PORTE-COCHERE

The porte-cochere is located on the east side of the building, adjoining Ellis Hall. This is a highly ornamented though small structure that would be potentially structurally stable if the remainder of the Main Building and Ellis Hall were to be removed. As it is located at the corner of the site, retaining the structure would not significantly interfere with the use of the open space, and it could be reused as a shaded seating area or other passive open space component. Removal of the Main Building would require that a new west façade be built to the porte-cochere structure, as it presently adjoins the east side of the Main Building. This could be accomplished through the salvage of brick and stone from the Main Building, to create a historically appropriate, as well as aesthetically pleasing, façade. Removal of Ellis Hall, which is located north of, but is not connected to the porte-cochere, would allow for greater visibility of, and access to, the structure. The feasibility of the retention and reuse of this structure would require additional structural study.

10.2.4 PUBLIC OUTREACH/EDUCATION

Creating public outreach or education programs, such as lectures, exhibits, and/or publications (such as pamphlet on the history of St. Paul's), is a potential mitigation measure. Potential future interpretive exhibits, either to be located on-site or in an off-site location, could display artifacts and elements salvaged from the Main Building, as well as recent and historic photographs and would include historical narratives. Any lectures, educational programs, exhibits, or printed material, could be developed in consultation with groups such as the Garden City Historical Society, SPLIA, and the Committee to Save St. Paul's.