

**APPENDIX A**

**COST PROPOSAL**

2019/22 OCT 18 PM 12:06

**(To be submitted in a separately sealed envelope)**

The fee proposal shall include all the services required in the Request for Proposal for the services outlined herein. Estimated completion time must be included with cost proposal.

The Village will evaluate the fee proposal of the Firm who is technically rated first, with a goal to negotiate an Agreement that represents the best value to the Village for these defined services.

Proposer: Angel Ayón, AIA, LEED AP, AYON Studio Architecture • Preservation, P.C.  
Title: Principal

<u>Proposed Services</u>	<u>Total</u>
Develop and submit to the Village a full comparative analysis of the benefits and disadvantages to renovate or demolish the existing Saint Paul's Complex  <b>AYON Studio Consultants</b>	\$  \$54,500 \$135,300

Total: \$189,800

Estimated Completion Time

Number of Days: TBD upon award

## A – PROJECT UNDERSTANDING

The project refers to an existing five-story building located along on the northwest corner of Stewart Avenue and Rockaway Avenue in Garden City, Long Island. Built in 1871 as an educational complex, this fine example of High Victorian Gothic was designed by William H. Harris. The building is E-shaped in plan, with three wings that once accommodated laboratories, classrooms libraries, dining halls, kitchens, workspaces, a reception parlor, and a gothic chapel with tiffany stained-glass windows. The property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1978 as part of the A. T. Stewart Era Buildings. It operated as a school until its closure in 1991 due to loss of funding, which led to its acquisition by the Incorporated Village of Garden City (the "Village") in 1993. The Village is seeking a full comparative analysis of the benefits and disadvantages of renovating or demolishing the existing Saint Paul's Complex. This evaluation will assess existing conditions and compliance with NYS Building Code, as well as compare the financial costs, energy savings, and environmental impact of demolition vs. adaptive reuse. The Incorporated Village of Garden City (the Client) seeks to retain AYON Studio to prepare a comparative analysis weighting building alternation and renovation versus demolition.

## B – PROJECT APPROACH

The following is a summary of the overall approach that will guide AYON Studio's proposed interventions for this project:

### **Overall Approach**

AYON Studio integrates architecture, design, historic preservation, and materials conservation to ensure a structure's new life is even better than its previous one. Knowing how to bridge the gap between various disciplines is how the firm addresses the unique challenges that arise when intervening in existing buildings, and particularly on culturally significant historic structures. Given the historic character of the assets under the St. Paul's Complex, AYON Studio proposes that the property be treated with an acknowledgement of its fragility and potential. This will ensure that any proposed work has no negative impact on the characteristic features determining the values and cultural significance of these historic buildings.

### **Historic Preservation and Adaptive Reuse Design Philosophy**

The successful design approach for a Historic Preservation project demands the resolution of many complex issues related to program, budget and physical constraints of the existing structure. Those design solutions could require the creation of new spaces in the existing building and/or the addition of a new structure. Melding the old and new in an appropriate and sensitive way is the challenge. Successful adaptive reuse mandates that these spaces must not only satisfy the functional needs of the users, but must, more importantly, contribute to the dignity of the functions housed therein. The design layouts, materials, lighting and all other project details must be carefully selected and arranged to symbolically express these values; moreover, they must complement each other so that the overall composition instills the proper respect for the institution to be housed, while simultaneously creating a comfortable environment that will uplift anyone visiting or working in that institution.

AYON Studio's Preservation philosophy follows well-established intervention principles that are rooted in the US Secretary of Interiors' Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, including the following: 1. Retain the building's historic character by keeping original materials; 2. Retain changes that occurred over time; 3. Preserve distinctive features; 4. Repair rather than replace; replace in kind if necessary; substantiate replacements; 5. Treatments must not be injurious; 6. New work must not destroy historic character, and must be differentiated from, and be compatible with, existing historic building fabric; 7. New work must be reversible with historic

materials unimpaired; 8. Avoid radical changes that will obscure, damage, or destroy character-defining materials or features in the process of rehabilitation work to meet current code and energy requirements; and 9. Add no historical elements without evidence.

### **Design Philosophy**

At AYON Studio, we believe that good design transcends time. To that end, we are committed to providing our Clients with the services necessary to preserve, rehabilitate, or add to, their historic buildings. Adaptive Reuse, Building Conservation, Rehabilitation and Additions are challenging tasks that are best achieved by an experienced preservation firm. We apply our deep understanding of historic materials, construction methods, and a property's cultural significance, to a creative process that yields solutions respectful of, and contributing to, a building's sense of place. AYON Studio is quite adept at weaving new construction and infrastructure into historic buildings so as to minimize, if not completely mitigate, their impact. We work with engineers and other project team members to design infrastructure upgrades so that these are inserted with surgical precision in the interstitial spaces, in order to disturb as little as possible original finishes and maintain the maximum authenticity of fabric. When design interventions interact with the original building fabric, we endeavor to ensure that these design moves respect the original, and that both original and new architecture heighten the awareness of each other. We perceive adaptive reuse as the ultimate act in sustainability, and new additions to historic structures as a way of enhancing the original and fulfilling programmatic requirements, while providing beautifully designed interventions that are representative of our era.

### **Creativity of Solutions**

AYON Studio is quite adept at weaving new construction and infrastructure into historic buildings so as to minimize, if not completely mitigate, their impact. We work with engineers and other project team members to design infrastructure upgrades so that these are inserted with surgical precision in the interstitial spaces, in order to disturb as little as possible original finishes and maintain the maximum authenticity of fabric. When design interventions interact with the original building fabric, we endeavor to ensure that these design moves respect the original, and that both original and new architecture heighten the awareness of each other. We perceive adaptive reuse as the ultimate act in sustainability, and new additions to historic structures as a way of enhancing the original and fulfilling programmatic requirements, while providing beautifully designed interventions of our era.

### **Rehabilitation and Additions**

The key to AYON Studio's approach to intervening in historic properties is based on applying a thoughtful and thorough analysis to determine the cause of each problem, rather than simply repairing, or replacing evidently failed material. Such an analysis eliminates unnecessary interventions, helps avoid the same problems from recurring, and saves the most original "fabric." It also reduces owners' long-term costs by having repairs endure and prevents further deterioration in currently unaffected areas. The best way to provide successful, cost-effective solutions is to understand fundamental pathologies and life-cycle cost analysis—sometimes doing less is worth more. AYON Studio offers realistic alternatives and priorities that assist the Owner in making informed decisions and taking the most appropriate actions. In addition, AYON Studio has an in-depth understanding of the historic, scientific, aesthetic, social and spiritual values which may apply to buildings of cultural significance. We work within the guidelines of the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, the Venice Charter, Burra Charter, and the Nara Document on Authenticity. All interventions proposed by AYON Studio carefully consider the implications to authenticity and site significance within the framework of these national and international documents. We have extensive experience successfully procuring approvals from various agencies having jurisdiction, such as the New York City

Landmarks Preservation Commission, the New York State Office of Parks and Historic Preservation (a.k.a. State Historic Preservation office or SHPO) and various other agencies of the federal government.

### **Design within Context**

As a team we consider quality design, to be an experience to which all people are entitled as it directly impacts and improves the way in which we live and work. For us design quality is not just about how a project looks, as important as that is. Rather it is about commitment, resourcefulness and experience based intelligence. These are the attributes that we endeavor to bring to each of our projects.

### **Work in Collaborative Environment with Client and other Design Consultants**

AYON Studio excels at the systematic and coordinated management of complex projects at multiple sites. We have experience with multi-year, multi-million-dollar term contracts with various public agencies including GSA, USACE and USPS at the federal level; SUNY, MTA, and PANYNJ at the state level; as well as with various local agencies in NYC including SCA, DOE, and DEP. We successfully and frequently manage several projects for each one of these clients simultaneously, and for others as well. For instance, during previous NYC Department of Buildings Facade Inspection and Safety Program (FISP, formerly known as Local Law 10/80, and later as Local Law 11/98), the firm provided critical examination, repair documents and construction administration when required, report compilation and filing for several buildings, while handling other projects. We are able to do this because we are extremely well organized and efficient, and because we have seasoned professionals who direct our projects. Our extensive experience with our selected consultants provides for the smooth execution of projects.

## **C – ADDITIONAL INFORMATION**

### **Insurance**

As requested on the RFP, AYON Studio will issue a Certificate of Insurance naming the Incorporated Village of Garden City on the following policies:

Commercial	Each Occurrence	\$1,000,000
	General Aggregate	\$2,000,000
Automobile	Each Accident	\$1,000,000
Workers' Compensation and Employers' Liability		
	Each Occurrence	\$1,000,000
Professional	Per Claim	\$1,000,000
	General Aggregate	\$1,000,000

There are no insurance claims, lawsuits, or arbitrations over the last 3 years.

### **Company Information**

Years in Business: 9 years

Number of Employees: 6 full time.  
2 part time.

### **Ongoing Projects**

The ongoing projects are in various construction phases. Please note that the current and foreseeable workload for the proposed staff consists of four to six projects at various stages of

completion. If the client chooses to select our team for this project, we do not anticipate any issues with getting the staff ready to work on the project on a short notice.

## D – SCOPE OF SERVICES

AYON Studio proposes the following professional services for this project:

### 1. Documentation

During this Phase, AYON Studio will provide the following services:

- a. **Document Review:** We will review previous existing conditions reports, assessments, drawings and photographs prepared by others (to be provided by the Client) outlining the nature and condition of significant building features, previously documented changes, existing conditions, decays patterns, repairs recommendations, etc. This will allow us to gain a better understanding of relevant conditions identified in the past, and of how said conditions have changed since, whether as a result of decay, repair work or other actions.
- b. **Preliminary Building Documentation:** AYON Studio will visit the project site to become familiar with the nature and condition of the existing buildings and typical construction assemblies at both the exteriors and the interiors. It is understood that existing drawings (typical floor plans, sections, elevations, etc.) are limited. AYON Studio will use the existing drawings to be provided by the Client as the base for the conditions assessment.

AYON Studio will perform a preliminary existing conditions assessment of the existing building exteriors and interiors included in the scope of work (depending on available access), and based on the limited documentation resulting from the drawings to be provided by the Client, to evaluate the condition of existing spaces, building components and distinctive features, as well as the repair/replacement needs of all exterior and interior character-defining building features at each building. The existing-conditions assessment will be performed in conjunction with the project's structural and Mechanical, Electrical, Plumbing and fire Protection (MEP/FP) engineers.

The preliminary assessment will allow to gain a better understanding of the degree of decay and state of physical integrity of character-defining features throughout the complex. It will also help to define the overall scope and extent of the required structural repairs, restorative exterior work and their associated cost. The assessment will become the basis for a preservation plan (see below) that will help define the potential for interior alterations at each building depending, among other factors, on their location, required exterior and structural work, interior conditions, etc.

- c. **Structural Evaluation:** AYON Studio will work with the structural engineer, Old Structures Engineering , P.C. (OSE) to perform an existing conditions assessment of the existing buildings structure; in particular of the structural elements requiring removal, replacement and/or reinforcement. The goal of the structural evaluation is to determine the configuration and condition of the existing structure at the building, and to evaluate the impact of any required removal / replacement work on the building structure and other fragile significant features adjacent, suspended from, or attached to, the existing structure.
- d. **Building Systems Evaluation:** AYON Studio will work with the MEP/FP Engineer, Landmark Facilities Group (LFG) to perform an existing conditions assessment of the existing

mechanical, electrical, plumbing and fire suppression systems. The goal of the MEP/FP evaluation is to determine the current condition of the MEPFP systems, identify the required repairs and/or replacement and identify the systems that could be improved for better energy efficiency.

- e. Hazmat Evaluation:** AYON Studio will work with the Environmental Consultant, JLC Environmental (JLC) to perform a limited preliminary hazmat survey, including at a minimum an Asbestos Containing Materials (ACM) Survey and Analysis, Lead Based Paint and PCB Survey and Analysis, and a Mold Assessment Survey. The findings of the hazmat survey will be reported as part of the Team's submission.

## 2. Conceptual Design

- a. Adaptive Reuse Pre-Schematic Design:** AYON Studio will identify design opportunities through the complex, as well as the main assets defining the architectural character and value of the different spaces, such as location, layout, exterior views, significant space relationships, distinctive features and finishes to be retained and/or enhanced, etc. During this phase, AYON Studio will present to the Client various suitable use programs for the adaptive reuse of the complex, and will work with the Client to choose one (1) program to be used as the basis of the conceptual design for adaptive reuse.

Based on this conceptual program selection, AYON Studio will prepare and present to the Client selective removal and proposed renovation and addition options to address the scope outlined in the aforementioned Project Understanding section. As part of this process, AYON Studio will work with the Client to determine how each proposed technical, spatial and aesthetic decision will affect both the budget and the overall project scheduling and phasing, if any. AYON Studio will assist the Client in selecting a proposed configuration and scope of work, as well as with determining an overall scope of work for cost estimating purposes, and establishing project phases if required to meet the Client's budget and schedule, if any.

- b. Cost Estimation:** AYON Studio will work with the Cost Estimator, Stuart Lynn Company, Inc. (Stuart-Lynn) to prepare an order of magnitude cost estimate of the proposed conceptual adaptive reuse solution. AYON Studio will work with the cost estimator to perform a comparative cost benefit analysis for demolition vs. renovation.

## 3. Report and Recommendations

The report to be prepared by AYON Studio will include an abbreviated historic analysis of the complex and its context. The cultural significance of the St. Paul's Complex and its technological, historical and social values will be outlined. Each of the building elements will be analyzed for Qualitative Conditions (Good, Fair, Poor, Missing) and Deficiency Rating (Minor, Serious, Critical). The above analysis will guide programmatic alternatives to demolition, including Adaptive Reuse. The analysis of each alternative will include a description, and a summary of their pros and cons. The report will include an order-of-magnitude estimated cost for both adaptive reuse and selective removal / demolition. A recommendations will be included regarding what alternative, or combination thereof, should be pursued.

## E – PROFESSIONAL FEES

AYON Studio will perform the services described above for the following fees:

Documentation .....	\$17,900
Conceptual Design.....	\$17,800
Report & Recommendations .....	<u>\$18,800</u>
	<b>\$54,500</b>

### Consultants

MEP Consultant .....	\$21,800
Structural Consultant (*) .....	\$28,600
Environmental Consultant (**) .....	\$45,300
Cost Estimator .....	<u>\$39,600</u>

**\$135,300**

\* This fee includes an add alternate for maintain existing East, West and South facades with the structural design to support the facades.

\*\* The preliminary hazmat testing shall not exceed the fees above. The actual fees may vary based on the samples collected and tested.

### Exclusions

- Presentations for public review of findings and recommendations.
- Preparation of existing conditions drawings, which shall be provided to AYON Studio in electronic format, including but not limited to existing floor plans, sections and elevations of the existing building.
- Schematic Design, Design Development, Construction Documents, DOB Filing, Construction Contract Administration services.
- New York State Historic Preservation Tax Credit application.
- Construction means and methods, labor coordination and supervision, site protection and site safety.
- Property survey, which if required should be provided by a licensed Professional Surveyor.
- DOB filing, fees and/or penalties, if any.
- Superseding current Applicant of Record (AOR) for open DOB application(s) and assistance with signing off open DOB application(s).
- Hazardous materials testing and specifications, if required.
- Exploratory probes, which if required, shall be provided by the Client's Contractor.
- Site access in the form of ladders, pipe scaffolds, two-point suspended platforms, man-lifts or similar means of aerial access, which if required, shall be provided by the Client.
- RES/COMCheck analysis to verify compliance with NYC Energy Conservation Code.
- Engineering services, including Structural, M/E/P, Fire Protection, Vertical transportation, A/V, acoustics, Support of Excavation (SOE), etc., if needed.
- Special Inspections, which if required shall be performed by a certified Special Inspection Agency retained by the Client.
- Protection Plan for Construction Work adjacent to historic buildings.
- Structural monitoring during construction of individually designated Landmark(s) or building(s) in a designated historic district, as required by NYC TTPN-1088.
- DOB Post-approval amendment(s) for additional work.
- Materials analysis and testing, including laboratory and/or field testing required to verify the structural integrity of existing guardrails, handrails and/or balcony enclosures, as applicable, and as required for FISP compliance, or for any other purpose.
- Self-certification of drawings and/or forms to be filed with DOB.
- Determining recommended Design Flood Elevation (DFE) for the most appropriate level of protection for the FEMA 500 year flood plain; preparing Flood Risk Assessment Reports or Flood Elevation Certificates, building-wide Perimeter Flood Protection Boundary plans and other related studies required for flood mitigation design and compliance.
- Cost Estimating and Cost-Benefit analyses of proposed repair/replacement work.

- Value Engineering of proposed solutions.
- Photorealistic professional artist's renders showing the overall appearance, materials and details of the proposed exterior enclosure, which will be provided as needed as a reimbursable expense.
- Professional services, depositions, statements, meetings, conference calls or any other type of communication, whether oral or written, regarding legal services, whether they are related or unrelated to the subject properties, the project, or elsewhere.
- Professional services not listed hereto or included in the scope of services to be provided by others, as listed above.

### **Reimbursable Expenses**

It is customary for the Client to cover certain expenses incurred by the Architect while providing professional services. These include reprographic, postal, messenger services and overnight mail delivery. All reimbursable expenses shall be billed with a 1.10 multiplier. Records of AYON Studio's expenses pertaining to the project shall be kept in a generally recognizable format and shall be made available to the Client or its representatives at times convenient to the Client and AYON Studio.

### **Consultants/Sub-Contractors**

The services of Consultants/sub-Contractors required either by the Client or by the demands of the project, if any, shall be invoiced at cost times a 1.10 multiple above and beyond the fees outlined above. The Client shall approve in advance the use of all such Consultants/sub-Contractors.

### **Additional Services**

Additional services by our professional staff are available for any work requested beyond the scope of work established above and will be billed according to the following hourly rates:

Principal .....	\$300
Associate / Project Manager .....	\$250
Project Architect .....	\$200
Jr. Architect .....	\$150
Draftsperson .....	\$90
Consultants .....	x 1.10

### **Billing**

Invoices will be submitted upon completion of each project phase, or on a monthly basis, whatever comes first. Payment is due upon issuance of invoices. By accepting this proposal, the Client acknowledges that any payment overdue by 30 days or more is subject to a monthly 3.5% overcharge of the due amount, which will be charged by and made payable to AYON Studio above and beyond the original contract amount. A \$10,000 (Ten Thousand US Dollars) deposit is due upon approval of this proposal. The deposit will be credited against the total fees to be invoiced by AYON Studio for the services rendered for the project.

## **CONTRACT TERMS**

### **Client's Responsibility**

In order to accomplish our work, it is understood that complete cooperation and coordination between AYON Studio, the Client, and any other Consultants/Contractors in the employ of the Client, will be provided. The Client shall designate a representative authorized to act on its behalf with respect to the work; assist AYON Studio's staff in gaining access to the various spaces, including but not limited to, tenant-occupied spaces, if applicable; and act as a

coordinating agent between AYON Studio and the occupants of the various spaces, so as to ensure that the onsite documentation is performed in an efficient manner.

#### **Covid-19 Public Health Emergency Restrictions**

During the course of the fieldwork for the Documentation phase and any other project tasks requiring an onsite-presence, AYON Studio will follow the guidelines recommended by the Center for Disease Control, NYC Department of Health and Human Services, and other relevant government agencies to prevent the spread of the Coronavirus, including adherence to social distancing and wearing of personal protective equipment. It is expected that all parties at the project site, including but not limited to Client, contractors, shareholders, board members and their representatives, adhere to the same rules and recommendations. AYON Studio reserve the right to stop work when said rules and recommendations are not followed.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Upon written authorization to proceed, AYON Studio is willing to commence this project immediately.

#### **Acceptance**

If the terms of this proposal are acceptable, please sign below and return a copy to AYON Studio along with the deposit referenced above. Upon receipt of the signed proposal, AYON Studio will prepare an AIA B101-2007 Standard Form of Agreement Between the Owner and the Architect.

---

Name

---

Authorized Signature

---

Date